Comprehension Difficulties with the Boas-Hunt kwakwala Texts

Peter Wilson

Contents

0.	Introd	luction	2
1.1.	The Re Kwakiu	tl Tales - New Series ligion of the Kwakiutl and tl Texts - Second Series	4 4 4
	Genera Notes	5 5	
2.1.	Data: Simila Differ		6 6 7
3.1.	Data: Simila Differ		8 9 10
4.1.	Data: Simila Differ		11 11 12
5.0.	A Note	on Dialect	13
6.0.	Discus	sion	14
		Boas Orthography 1940+ Boas Orthography 1900-1940	15 16
Refer	ences		17

Comprehension Difficulties with the Boas-Hunt kwakwala Texts

Peter Wilson

0. Introduction

During work on kwakwala, I often re-elicited material published earlier. The works I surveyed included material by Boas and Hunt and other early researchers and missionaries. 1 Among these early written recordings of kwakwala, only the works by Boas and Hunt present a consistent and accurate orthography and transcription of the language. 2

Although much of Boas and Hunt's grammar and dictionary publications were able to be re-elicited, much of the textual work was not understood very well. This was puzzling, especially since the dictionary and grammar information came from the texts.

In 1985 I had the opportunity to work with James Henderson. We spent much of our time talking about the days when he was a boy and about the people that he had known. I took this opportunity to read to him some of the stories recorded by Boas and Hunt. I focused on the texts from "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series," (Boas 1935, 1943) "The Religion of the Kwakiutl Indians," (Boas 1930a, 1930b) and "Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series" (Boas and Hunt 1906). My goal was to attempt to re-elicit the textual material by having Mr. Henderson listen to the stories in kwakwala while providing him with the opportunity to comment, translate, and repeat samples of the material.

James Henderson had no difficulty understanding stories from "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943). On the other hand, he had some difficulty understanding stories from "The Religion of the Kwakiutl" (Boas 1930a, 1930b) and "Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series" (Boas and Hunt 1906).

¹ These included: Boas (1930a, 1930b, 1935, 1943, 1947, 1948), Boas and Hunt (1906), Hall (1882a, 1882b), Scouler (1841), Hale (1846), Schoolcraft (1853), Gibbs (1877), Tolmie and Dawson (1884), Dawson (1887), and various Bible and Hymn translations (e.g. Hall 1897, 1899).

² See Wilson 1982 for a detailed review of these works.

In this study, I set out to discover what differences exist between the three series of texts. I expected that comprehension would be affected by one or both of differences in language and differences in background knowledge. This hypothesis is based on suggestions made in Wilson (1982) and Berman (1991).

The results of this study demonstrate two points. First, all three series of stories are generally accurate in transcription, lexical items, morphology, and syntax. Among the three, "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943) is more accurate than the other two. This is consistent with the findings in Wilson (1982). Second, "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943) contains stories, characters, events, and places that were familiar to Mr. Henderson. The earlier two series of stories, on the other hand, present words, themes, stories, and background information with which Mr. Henderson was not as familiar (Boas 1906, 1930a, 1930b).

The differences between the later series (Boas 1935, 1943) and the earlier two series (Boas 1906, 1930a, 1930b) are probably not significant enough to account for the lower level of comprehension from the earlier works alone. Perhaps, as suggested in Berman (1991), differences in background knowledge may contribute to overall comprehension.

1.0 Background

The material discussed in this paper comes from two different periods in Boas' work (from Wilson 1982).

"Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" comes from the post 1940

"phonemic" period. The English translation was published in 1935 (Boas 1935) and the kwakwala version was published in 1943 Boas (1943). The other two works, "Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series" Boas and Hunt (1906) and "The Religion of the Kwakiutl Indians" (Boas (1930a, 1930b) come from Boas' "middle" period. This middle period was "pre-phonemic" but generally accurate.3

1.1 Kwakiutl Tales - New Series

I chose "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943) for two reasons. First, it contains stories written by Hunt which were originally told by story tellers with whom Mr. Henderson was familiar. Second, my earlier research had shown that this text collection presented a consistent and accurate transcription of kwakwala (Wilson 1982). In addition, I anticipated that Mr. Henderson would be able to understand the texts because several stories were told by speakers familiar to Mr. Henderson.

"Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" was published in two volumes: English translation (Boas 1935) and Kwakiutl (Boas 1943). Appendix 1 presents a comparison between the Boas (1935, 1943) orthography and my own.

1.2 The Religion of the Kwakiutl and Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series

I choose "The Religion of the Kwakiutl" (Boas 1930a, 1930b) because it presented a description of events rather than specific tales / texts recorded from other speakers. Generally, this volume is a collection of informative stories written by George Hunt (see Berman 1991 for a discussion of the method of data collection and recording employed by Boas and Hunt).

"The Religion of the Kwakiutl" was published in two volumes: Kwakiutl (1930a) and English translations (1930b). Appendix

The term "phonemic" is used to describe Boas' later transcription. In later works, Boas began a process of eliminating symbols that are predictable. For example, he dispensed with /1/, a variant of /e/ in the environment of palato-velars. The pre-phonemic period from 1900-1940 was generally accurate but contained a large number of symbols that are predictable variants.

2.0 Kwakiutl Tales - New Series

As mentioned above, James Henderson appeared to have no difficulty understanding the kwakwala in "Kwakiutl Tales -New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943). During our sessions he made comments on the transcription, word formation, syntax, translations, and proper names. The most difficult aspect of the tales were with the mythical names in the stories. Occasionally, we had to consult the translation.

2.1. Similarities

The language in "Kwakiutl Tales: New Series" (Boas 1935, 1943) is accurate and not much different from the language of James Henderson. The lexical items, transcription, morphology, syntax, and dialect were re-elicited without difficulty. Examples are presented below:

Word Formation - Morphology

mele xlaq K.T. B.H.211.69 to look behind

meliXXa JH 05/03/85

Morphology

g·āx^Easaqos K.T. B.H.211.79 ga¥⁷asaqus JH 05/03/85

those you have come with

Lexical

tse'lawe K.T. B.H.212.99 wild crabapples

celxw JH 05/04/85

tle'lsa K.T. B.H.213.139 cranberries

fols JH 05/04/85

Place Names

a^Ewī'tbalis K.T. B.H.210.36

?auithalis JH 05/01/85

Wells Point in the mouth of Wells Pass

yū'L!e K.T. B.H.210.38 Rand Island

leque Ema

ııXı JH 05/01/85

leqwe'ma KT B.H. 59.8 JH 04/30/85

village name (B.H. tribe)

2 presents a comparison of the orthography used in Boas (1930a, 1930b) and my own.

Finally, I choose "Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series" (Boas 1906) because it is similar to "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series," (Boas 1935, 1943) only earlier in publication. This series, like the later series, is a collection of legends which George Hunt collected. As noted in Berman (1991), Hunt listened to the stories and then later wrote them down. Again, I read stories from the tribes with which James Henderson was familiar. Unfortunately, the names of the story tellers are not listed in this publication.

"Kwakiutl Text - Second Series" was one in a number of publications for the Jesup North Pacific Expedition. Both English translation and Kwakiutl are presented on each page in two columns. Appendix 2 presents the comparison between the orthography used in Boas (1906) and my own.

1.3 General Comments

In order to elicit the information, I read the stories in $k^{\omega}ak^{\omega}ala$ to Mr. Henderson. I stopped after each sentence (or major idea) and we discussed the section. I took notes during our discussions. When passages were difficult we consulted the English translation of the text.

During our collaboration, Mr. Henderson not only provided insights into the texts but also anecdotes about the story tellers and the times. Generally speaking, he was able to comprehend many of the stories, recognize words, and suggest corrections to the transcriptions.

1.4 Notes on the Examples

In the examples presented below, the Boas material is presented in his orthography and Mr. Henderson's work is presented in my own. Since Mr. Henderson's comments were not always phrased in the same sentence as the original, the inflectional morphology is not always the same as the original. Abbreviations used in the examples are listed below:

Kwakiutl Tales - New Series (Boas 1935, 1943) K.T. R.K. The Religion of the Kwakiutl (Boas 1930a, 1930b) K.Txt.2 Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series (Boas 1906)

K.D.

Kwakiutl Dictionary (Boas 1948)

Page and line numbers are listed 2.2, i.e. page 2, line 2.

Names of People

wā'xoʻna'kwelas KT B.H. 59.10 name waxonakwelas JH 04/30/85

Pelakilağuğ™a JH 05/01/85

2.3 Differences

The discrepancies between Boas' text and James Henderson review include differences in transcription, morphology, syntax, and translation.

Transcription Differences:

a expect i

he menata KT B.H. 59 all the time hemenała JH 04/30/85

Add final ?

q!āłe' KT B.H. 59 news **4a4i?** JH 04/30/85

Translation Differences: Lexical Choice

James Henderson noted that the English translations did not always match the $\mathbf{k} \sim \mathbf{k} \sim \mathbf{k} \sim \mathbf{k}$. In the example below, he preferred a different lexical item than the one used in the story.

ge' genax La' clae K.T. B.H. 113.22 Boas: little girls

čačidağememeni‱ JH 05/01/85 J.H. little girls

J.H. suggested "little girls" (from Boas' English translation) was best translated into kwakwala with the word based on &a&adagem "girl" not with the word based on gena. The word gena is translated as "infant girl" (see 1948, page 313), and is also used as a familiar address name for a young girl (J.H.).

Translation Differences: Word Formation

In some examples, the word used in the story contained rootsuffix combinations that Mr. Henderson translated differently. In the following example, the English version of the story describes "a mat in front of" some people. Mr. Henderson, on the other hand, interpreted the kwakwala as "to have a mat over the head."

Lepdza'emolife's K.T. B.H.212.107 to have a mat in front to have mat over (J.H. translation) **Sepemli4*
JH 05/04/85
to have a mat on floor in house

Syntactic Differences

Occasionally, James Henderson suggested alternative sentence structure. In the following example, he preferred a non-"passive" non-quotative alternate to the original.

q!we c la c l c l c l c la c g c ay c s c Wela c alis c d z lgayos K.T. B.H. 113.13 JH 05/01/85 Their digging sticks were hidden.

J.H. prefers this sentence to the Boas text which uses the $-su^{2}$ ("passive") and $-\Gamma_{a^{2}i}$ (quotative) suffixes.

Lexical Difficulties

Some words in the stories were not recognized by Mr. Henderson. An example is presented below:

k·!ɛ'lkwa*ma'laxes k·!ɛlā'ku KolkwamalaXis Kolakw K.T. B.H. 113.19
They quarrelled about their digging sticks. J.H. was not sure about the meaning of the word Kolakw.

3.0. Data: The Religion of the Kwakiutl

James Henderson had difficulty comprehending some of the information in "The Religion of the Kwakiutl." His translation of the kwakwala was sometimes different from the texts and indicated a difference in comprehension. Again, the most difficult aspect of the stories was with the mythical names and places in the stories. We needed to consult the translation far more frequently than with "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series" in order to decipher words and the general understanding of the story.

7

8

3.1. Similarities

The language in "The Religion of the Kwakiutl" is generally accurate and not much different from the language of James Henderson. Individual lexical items, transcription, morphology, and syntax patterns, were re-elicited without much difficulty. Examples are presented below:

Morphology

Lë Lemata R.K. B.H.61.33 λiλa' Wata JH 08/24/85

standing up, place of standing

Morphology (reduplication)

e&∕sē

7i 7osi

R.K. B.H.62.19

your fathers

JH 08/24/85

Morphology (transitive)

ts!o ts!EtemdLesg.ada **ducetemd** R.K. B.H.67.14

JH 09/03/85

to put black on your face (&4a "black" + -d "transitive")

Place Names

aLō´ ^e l ēno wē

?aXulinuX™

JH 08/29/85

R.K. B.H.64.13 people from behind

Names of People

no ng axtacye

nungeXtewi JH 08/29/85

R.K. B.H.63.3

Name: head wolf in story, from ruyem "knowledge"

Names of Dances

hămā'selat

JH 08/29/85

R.K. B.H.64.9 hamada dance

ha'maselat

3.2. Differences

The discrepancies between Boas' text and James Henderson's review include differences in language and background knowledge. Although the language presented in this series of texts is slightly more different from Mr. Henderson's kwakwala than Boas (1935, 1943), it is, nonetheless, very similar.

Transcription (m should be m)

€me′lmagelākwē

mela

R.K. B.H.68.23 to weave, to twist JH 09/06/85

Transcription (q should be qw)

qitolax >>> qwitolax qëla' lax JH 09/13/85 R.K. B.H. 69.8

The book contains qitolax "to listen to water" but it should be qwitolax "to untie"

Lexical

tsemo tledex comufedex (not sure)

R.K. B.H.64.4 JH 08/29/85

J.H. did not recognize this word. Boas lists tse mota in

K.D. as "to be silent. quiet" p. 198.

Morphology (Reduplication)

nau'alakwasa na?e'nwalekw

R.K. B.H 62.31 JH 08/27/85

plural of nawalek™ "supernatural power"

Background Knowledge

An example of the difference in background knowledge between the text and Mr. Henderson is with a dance ritual known in kwakwala as /wwigwedza/. Boas translates /wwigwedza/ as "a member of the Sparrow Society." Mr. Henderson translates this as "the false part of the ritual where people used different names." This difference made comprehending the story difficult: the text used the word to describe a person whereas Mr. Henderson translated the word as the name of the ritual.

Şwē´ Şwēs∈ma€ya ğwiğwi samağa R.K. B.H.62.25 JH 08/27/85 Boas translates this word as a proper name "Head Sparrows." J.H. translates this word as the false name part of the ritual.

\$\text{\$\tex{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$

In addition, Mr. Henderson was not able to confirm that /ʒwigwad²a/ referred to sparrows. He was aware of the ritual and provided several /ʒwigwad²a/ names in his family. Perhaps the form of the ritual described by George Hunt was different from the ritual described by James Henderson.

4.0. Kwakiutl Texts - New Series

The language used in Kwakiutl Texts - New Series is again generally accurate and not much different from the language of James Henderson. Individual lexical items, transcription, morphology, and syntax patterns, were relicited without much difficulty. Examples are presented below:

4.1. Similarities

Transcription

k·!ō'+ē
K.Txt.2 9.29 JH 05/17/85
Boas: Island in front of Denman. J.H. Tree Island off top end of Denman Island

ao'ms
K.Txt.2 10.8 JH 05/18/85
someone beyond ordinary

Morphology

 ne'x wusta
 ne we sta

 K.Txt.2
 18.2
 JH 05/23/85

 straight up river
 3 traight up river

Morphology (Reduplication)

 lā'la¥a~masēs
 lala¥em

 K.Txt.2
 12.40
 JH 05/18/85

 small basket
 JH 05/18/85

Lexical

gu'ldema gweldem K.Txt.2 13.34 JH 05/18/85 J.H. woodpecker (red breasted) "makes fire" **dē'da∈malē** K.Txt.2 15.11 possessions didamala JH 05/22/85

4.2 Differences

There were a number of differences in transcription between James Henderson and Boas and Hunt (1906). This series of texts is the least similar of the three. The greatest differences, however, came in the understanding of the cultural background behind the information.

Transcription (addition of we)

Transcription (ey should be y)

 Eyî'lş€wult!ā
 yelx⇔ttola

 K.Txt.2
 9.41
 JH 05/17/85

 dead animal over shoulder

Background Knowledge

The main differences in background knowledge occurred with proper names, regalia, and rituals. For example, the text uses proper names that Mr. Henderson felt were not correct.

L!ä'gasē /Řeǧasi/ should be >>> **%enca%sem**K.Txt.2 15.1 JH 05/22/85
name: Black Bear Woman.

ne'ngasē /nemgasi/ should be >>> ninemgas K.Txt.2 15.1 JH 05/22/85 name: Grisly Bear Woman.

It is interesting to note that at one point in the story the text uses the correct form of the word according to Mr. Henderson:

nergase ninerges
K.Txt.2 19.17 JH 05/22/85
name: Grisly Bear Woman. J.H. This is the correct form
for the proper name.

In another story, the main character puts on a mask to hide his face. The English translation of the text translates the mask as "old man" mask. The kwakwala version, on the other hand, uses two different words to represent this mask. Mr. Henderson translates one of the two mask words differently:

q!u'leyakumte K.Txt.2 3.18

&welagemł JH 05/14/85

Boas: old man mask. J.H. life mask.

nō'masemtē K.Txt.2 5.36

numasemi

K.IXL.2 5.36

Boas: old man mask. J.H. old man mask.

In the first example, the text uses the word /4wel3akwamt/. This word is based on /4wel3akw/ "old man" from /4wela/ "alive." Mr. Henderson interpreted the kwakwala as /4welagamt/ from /4wela/ "alive" and /-gamt/ "mask." Perhaps Mr. Henderson had never heard of a /4wel3akwamt/ and therefore substituted a mask that he knew: /4welagamt/. In the text version, therefore, we have one mask represented by two different words. In Mr. Henderson's translation, however, we have two different masks being worn at different times in the story.

5.0. Dialect

Some of the material Hunt collected from other kwakwala speakers (Boas 1906, 1935, 1943) preserves dialect differences. This is especially noteworthy because, as discussed in Berman (1991), Hunt listened to the stories and then later wrote them down from memory.

Two of the stories in Boas (1906) present examples of dialect preservation. These stories were collected from speakers from the Campbell River area who speak a dialect known as /ligwala/ or /ligwala/adwala/. Hunt used terms from this dialect in presenting the texts. James Henderson recognized these dialect differences and was able to indicate the origin of the words. For example:

we tlexias

K.Txt.2 4.10

Canoe. J.H. pointed out that witexa is the word for "canoe" in light as opposed to wakwena in kwakwala.

ma'malema
K.Txt.2 16.33 JH 05/22/85
swimming. J.H. notes that this is a liqual word and is not used in kwakwala.

The fact that Hunt has preserved dialect differences may account for some of the comprehension difficulties. For example, the use of /2wel3akwamt/ and /rumasamt/ for "old man mask" in Boas (1906) may in fact be evidence of a difference in dialect and not a difference in regalia terminology.

Unfortunately, until I have the opportunity to examine the kind and amount of dialect preservation in the Boas / Hunt materials, it remains unclear whether the differences are dialect or cultural knowledge based. In addition, I have not had an opportunity to evaluate whether Hunt retained pronunciation, morphological, and syntactic dialect traits.

6.0. Discussion

In summary, the three works present examples of kwakwala that do not greatly differ from the kwakwala spoken by Mr. Henderson. The latest work (Boas 1935, 1943) is the most similar, the first work (Boas 1906) is the least similar. These differences probably do not alone contribute to the comprehension difficulties encountered by Mr. Henderson with the two earlier series (Boas 1906, 1930a, 1930b).

As can be noted above, the main difficulties to comprehension were unknown words, proper nouns, and different understanding of words and sentences. Many of these differences in understanding are perhaps due to a difference in background knowledge. The earlier works present a higher incidence of unknown information than the later work.

In conclusion, differences in both language and background knowledge affect overall comprehension. Mr. Henderson's knowledge of kwakwala, i.e. his communicative competence, was sufficient to decode all aspects of "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series." His ability to decode the other two texts, however, was limited by differences in language and background knowledge. The source or cause of these differences, however, is a topic for further analysis. Two areas for additional enquiry suggested in this work are dialect and cultural knowledge differences.

Appendix 1: Boas orthography 1940+

Wilson	Во	as			
a i u e o	a i ü ä 8	ā I e o ō			
Wilson	Boas	W	ilson	Boas	
b p m m	b pl m e _m	d • • •		d t t! n	
d [®] c c s y	dz ts! s y e				
ж Ж К	e ^m κ. γ.¦ α.). }	ա տ Հա Հա	gw ku k!w	gu ku k!u
ጀ 4 8	ક ત ક	2	an Im Im Im	ain din din an	Xn dln dn ân
> * ! !	L L L! ! e!				
h ?	h E				

Boas does not write word initial glottal stop /#c... /. He also does not write glottal stop between two vowels /VV/. For example: Wilson

Boas eyebrows 7e⁷en **221**′n

Appendix 2: Boas Orthography 1900-1940

Wilson		Boas						
a i u e		a i ü ä	ā I o	e 5	ē	ë		
•		Œ	×	Ŷ	ŭ	^		
Wilson	Boas			Wilso	on	Boas		
b p p m m d c c c c s	b p p l m c m d z t s y c y			d t f n n s k k k		d t t! n en g: k· k·! x·		
9 K 2 2 K 2 3 K 2 3 K 2 3 K 3 4 K 3 3 K 3 4 K 3	gw ku klw g q q q q 	gu ku klu gu gu	gŭ kŭ k!ŭ gŭ	Х х	g.u	g. 8	Gw	6 ^u 68
작 및	qlw kw L L L! l c] t h	I L Xn Ain	q!8 x8					

The symbols / X $\,$ g. $\,$ 6 $\,$ r $\,$ I / are used infrequently. Boas does not write glottal stop in word initial position nor between vowels. Both occurrences are predictable.

362

References:

Berman 1991. "The Production of the Boas-Hunt Kwakw'ala Texts." In Papers for the 26th International Conference on Salish and Neighbouring Languages. Vancouver: U.B.C.

Boas 1930a. "The Religion of the Kwakiutl: Part 1-Texts." Columbia University Contributions to Anthropology, Volume X. New York: Columbia University Press.

Boas 1930b. "The Religion of the Kwakiutl: Part 2 Translations." Columbia University Contributions to Anthropology, Volume X. New York: Columbia University Press.

Boas 1935. "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series: Part 1-Translations." Columbia University Contributions to Anthropology, Volume XXVI. New York: Columbia University Press.

Boas 1943. "Kwakiutl Tales - New Series: Part 2-Texts." Columbia University Contributions to Anthropology, Volume XXVI. New York: Columbia University Press.

Boas 1947. "Kwakiutl Grammar with a Glossary of the Suffixes." Transactions of the American Philosophical Society: New Series-Volume 37, Part 3. Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society.

Boas 1948. "Kwakiutl Dictionary." Edited by Helene Boas Yampolsky. Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society.

Boas and Hunt 1906. "Kwakiutl Texts - Second Series." The Jesup North Pacific Expedition: Memoir of the American Museum of Natural History, New York, Volume X. New York: G.E. Stechert.

Dawson 1887. "Notes and Observations on the Kwakiool People." Transaction of the Royal Society of Canada, 1887, section II.

Gibbs 1877. "Vocabulary of the kwa'kiūtl'," in Dall, "Tribes of the Extreme Northwest," pages 144-153. Washington.

Hale 1846. "Hailtsa Vocabulary." In "Ethnography and Philology - U.S. Exploring Expedition," page 634. Philadelphia: C. Sherman.

Hall 1882a. "The Gospel According to St. Matthew." London: British Foreign Bible Society.

Hall 1882b. "The Kwagutl Mission, Vancouver Island." Church Missionary Intelligencer, 1882.

Hall 1897. "The Acts of the Apostles." London: British Foreign Bible Society.

Hall 1899. "A kwāgūtl Translation of Hymns as sung in the C.M.S. Missions on the North of Vancouver Island." London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge.

Scouler 1841. Observations on the Indigenous Tribes of the Northwest Coast of America. Journal of the Royal Society of London, pages 215-241. London.

Schoolcraft 1853. "Indian Tribes of the United States." Volume 3, page 402. Philadelphia: Lippincott, Grambo, and Company.

Tolmie and Dawson 1884. "Comparative Vocabularies of the Indian Tribes of British Columbia." Montreal: Dawson Brothers.

Wilson 1982. "Preserving and Disseminating kwakwala." Unpublished. Victoria: University of Victoria.